



Extract from the report to the  
Public Accounts Committee on  
the Danish Defence's support of its  
military operations in Afghanistan

September  
2009

revision  
revision

revision

## I. Introduction and results

1. This report is about the support provided by the Danish Defence (the Defence) to its military operations in Afghanistan with respect to supply services and training of soldiers and the Defence's performance against the targets set for international operations in the Danish Defence Agreement. The report is also addressing the extent of the civil-military cooperation and the Comprehensive Approach in Afghanistan. Rigsrevisionen has taken the initiative to the audit.

2. One of the objectives of the current Defence Agreement (2005-2009) is that the Defence should be able to mobilize and deploy forces in international operations and maintain deployed capacities corresponding to approx. 2,000 personnel. This figure represents an increase from approx. 1,150 personnel in 2005 to approx. 2,000 personnel in 2009. Furthermore, according to one of NATO's objectives, the member states should be able to deploy more forces in international operations. A special grant to cover the additional expenditure for international operations incurred by the Defence is included on the annual finance bills.

3. Rigsrevisionen has examined whether the Defence is capable of establishing the framework required for the performance of military tasks in international operations. Most importantly, the Defence should be able to ensure that supplies to the forces in the mission are implemented effectively; that the Defence is training sufficient personnel with the right qualifications to participate in international operations, and that pre-deployment training of the soldiers is effective. The requirements to training and supplies have increased, as the soldiers are now deployed to destinations further away from Denmark and under difficult, more demanding and dangerous conditions.

The examination does not include an assessment of operational activities, such as patrolling in the mission area and combat operations.

In the supply services area, it is essential that the units have access to the necessary equipment, and that the Defence is able to provide missing equipment at short notice. Being able to do that requires IT systems that support the deployed units.

With respect to training, it is essential that the Defence is training sufficient personnel with the right qualifications to participate in international operations. For the training to be considered effective, the soldiers should, for instance participate in most of the training sessions leading up to the mission; the necessary equipment should be available in the training sessions, and the conditions under which the training is taking place should be similar to conditions, which the soldiers will encounter in the mission. It is also of importance that the Defence ensures that the deployed soldiers live up to the training standards set for the various contingents by the Defence.

The Defence Agreement 2005-2009 was focused on strengthening and expanding the civil-military cooperation in relation to international operations. Rigsrevisionen has therefore examined the organization of the civil-military cooperation and the Comprehensive Approach in Afghanistan, including the capacities held to implement this effort.

Against this background, Rigsrevisionen has assessed the Ministry of Defence's and the Defence's support and management of international operations with focus on Afghanistan. The report answers four questions:

- Has the Ministry of Defence ensured that the objectives of the Defence Agreement concerning international operations have been achieved?
- Is the supply service provided by the Defence to the deployed soldiers satisfactory, and is the task being performed effectively by the Defence?
- Has the Defence ensured the availability of sufficient personnel with the right qualifications for international operations, and is the framework established for the pre-deployment training effective?
- How has the Ministry of Defence organized the civil-military cooperation (CIMIC), and how have the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs organized the Comprehensive Approach.

4. The audit covers the period after the Defence Agreement 2005-2009 took effect on 1 January 2005, and it is focused on the Defence's mission in Afghanistan.

### MAIN FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS

The number of soldiers deployed in international operations has increased in the period 2005-2008, and the Defence is meeting NATO's objectives concerning deployment of forces in international operations. However, the Defence has not been able to achieve the objective of the Defence Agreement concerning deployment of capacities corresponding to 2,000 soldiers in international operations. The Defence has estimated the total costs of international operations in 2008 at DKK 2.4 billion. The estimate is subject to some uncertainty due to the cost model applied.

The Defence has trained and deployed soldiers for the mission in Afghanistan in compliance with the decisions made by the Folketing (parliament), but the personnel situation in the Defence is under pressure, in particular with respect to availability of specialists.

Overall, Rigsrevisionen finds that the Defence is performing the supply task in a satisfactory manner. However, in some areas the task can be solved more effectively.

The Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have since 2006 increased their focus on the civil reconstruction effort in the Helmand province. Rigsrevisionen finds it positive that the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have prepared annual plans and set targets for the civil and military effort in Helmand.

Rigsrevisionen has not assessed the effect of the civil-military cooperation and the Comprehensive Approach. Rigsrevisionen considers it important that the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs continue to assess and adjust the effort in the area.

This overall assessment is based on the following findings:

**The Defence has increased the number of deployed soldiers in international operations considerably in the period 2005-2008, and the Defence is meeting NATO's objectives for the number of soldiers that can be deployed in international operations. Yet, the Defence has not been able to meet the target of the Defence Agreement according to which the Defence should be able to deploy capacities corresponding to 2,000 soldiers in international operations in 2009. The Defence has estimated the total costs of international operations in 2008 at DKK 2.4 billion. The estimate is subject to some uncertainty due to the cost model applied.**

- From 2005 to 2008, the Defence has increased the number of deployed soldiers from 1,213 to 1,421.
- Denmark is fulfilling NATO's objectives concerning mobilization and continuous maintenance of forces. Denmark is thereby in line with the NATO countries that we normally compare ourselves with.
- It has not been possible for the Defence to increase the capacity to deploy forces to the level assumed in the Defence Agreement. Defence Command Denmark has stated that the Defence will not be able to increase the number of soldiers by the end of 2009 and thereby achieve the target set in the Defence Agreement. The Defence has stated that the necessary framework has been established, but due primarily to shortage of personnel, it has not been possible to reach the required level of capacity. Shortage of specialists within the area of maintenance and supplies, and bottlenecks in the implementation of the training programme are the main causes.
- As opposed to the army and the navy, the air force does not estimate the total capacity to deploy forces to international operations in the number of soldiers than can be deployed. The special method of calculation applied by the air force is not documented.
- The Defence has estimated the total costs for international operations in 2008 at DKK 2.4 billion. The estimate is subject to some uncertainty due to the cost model used.
- International operations constitute one of the most important tasks performed by the Defence. The Defence's annual reports should therefore account for the activities that are considered the most important of its international operations, including the scope of available capacities. Furthermore, the Defence should be able to explain more accurately both the estimated and the actual consumption of resources for international operations.

**The Defence is providing the forces in Afghanistan with large quantities of goods and spare parts. The supply system reflects the fact that local stocks are kept relatively large, and the stock size is based on the Defence's experience with the level of consumption in the mission area. The long distances and the need for sufficient supplies in the theatre warrant the Defence's handling of the supply task. Rigsrevisionen finds that overall the Defence is performing the supply task in a satisfactory manner, but in some areas it can be performed more effectively.**

### *Supplies to Afghanistan*

- The Defence is providing the forces in Afghanistan with large quantities of goods and spare parts. The volume of supplies reflects the fact that local stocks are relatively large, and the stock size is based on the Defence's experience with the level of consumption in the mission area. The long distances and the need for sufficient supplies warrant the Defence's handling of the supply task.
- The Defence is using an IT-based automated stock control system to ensure sufficient supplies. When relevant, this system is complemented with manual stock control.
- In 2009, the Defence introduced summary reports on the operational state of large equipment that is considered decisive for the outcome of operations in Afghanistan. On the basis of the summaries, Defence Command Denmark is informed of the availability of the equipment to the deployed units.
- The Defence is preparing priority lists to ensure that prioritized supplies reach the units as fast as possible. Orders on the Afghanistan priority list are processed relatively fast and in Rigsrevisionen's opinion, the priority list is effective in relation to the Afghanistan mission.
- According to the Defence's records, Denmark received 30,000 orders from Afghanistan in 2008. The depot in Camp Bastion in Afghanistan received approx. 65 per cent of their orders within the requested delivery time in 2007 and 2008. The data providing the basis for the calculation are very uncertain and reservations must be made with respect to the measurement of the timeliness of deliveries, as the method of measurement was originally designed for the Defence's supply activities in Denmark and is not adjusted to international operations.
- The British defence is measuring the timeliness of deliveries differently than the Danish defence. The British defence measures the timeliness on the basis of targets set for the delivery time and it measures the combined delivery time for supplies. Rigsrevisionen is of the opinion that knowledge of the combined delivery time and setting relevant targets would contribute to making the supply chain system operate more effectively.

### *System support and training*

Supplies can be provided more effectively, and Rigsrevisionen therefore recommends the following:

- The Defence should ensure better data quality in the supply area and set relevant targets for the provision of supplies. This will facilitate measurement of the total time of delivery for supplies to Afghanistan, and enable systematic monitoring of stocks. This will also provide the Defence with an overview of the relevancy of its comparatively many outstanding orders. The Defence has indicated a need for improved controlling in the supply area. Rigsrevisionen finds it positive that the Defence has identified a need for a review of the supply chain to make it more effective, and that the Danish Defence Acquisition and Logistics Organization is working to improve the measurements of supply delivery times in relation with international missions.

- The Defence's IT system should to a higher extent support the supply requirements of the deployed forces. The Defence has stated that the current version of the IT system is only in a few areas adjusted to the requirements of the deployed forces and the conditions under which they are operating. The Defence will take these factors into consideration when the IT system is being upgraded in the future.
- The Defence should improve the training of the deployed supply personnel, as some personnel lack skills and experience handling the functions of the mission, and in particular experience with the IT system.
- In 2008, the Army Operational Command Denmark drew up a list of what it required from a service agreement with the Defence's Acquisition and Logistics Organization. The Ministry of Defence has stated that a service agreement will not be established between Defence Command Denmark and the Defence's Acquisition and Logistics Organization. Instead various venues have been established where the customer and supplier are getting an opportunity to harmonize their expectations. In the future, the overall relationship between customer and supplier will be managed through Defence Command Denmark's internal Annual Programme.

**The army has managed to train and deploy soldiers as planned, but the personnel situation in the Defence is under pressure, in particular with respect to the availability of specialists. The training programme is compressed, and the companies are making a serious effort to ensure that the soldiers can complete the training. However, the training programme can be improved in a number of areas. For instance, Defence Command Denmark could improve the planning and organization of the training and extend the administrative support provided to the companies that are being deployed.**

#### *Personnel for international missions*

- Rigsrevisionen's examination showed that as a result of the shortage of personnel, the Defence had on several occasions difficulties selecting and deploying personnel for the mission in Afghanistan. In consequence, the Defence Agreement 2010-2014 requires a strengthening of the personnel groups that are particularly in demand for international operations.
- The number of soldiers that are being temporarily promoted when they are deployed to Afghanistan has been on the increase. The reason is primarily shortage of personnel. The Defence has stated that the temporary promotions are made on the basis of individual assessments of each soldier's ability to solve concrete tasks in a satisfactory manner.
- The army has managed to deploy and train the planned number of companies. Yet, the Defence was been forced to deploy a company with ten soldiers less than planned (one full team), because many soldiers cancelled their engagement late in the process, and many candidates were considered unsuitable for deployment and rejected during the training programme. Rigsrevisionen considers it necessary and important that personnel that are not considered suitable for deployment are rejected during the training programme.

- The personnel are, for the better part, selected well in advance of deployment. But some units have experienced having personnel selected late in the training programme. As a consequence, the selected personnel have not been able to participate in parts of the training together with their colleagues. With the establishment of a reserve, the Defence has taken an important step in the direction of being able to deploy the soldiers in accordance with the plans and at the same time ensure that the deployed soldiers have gone through pre-deployment training together.
- With respect to the problems encountered concerning selection of personnel holding the right qualifications for international missions, it is Rigsrevisionen's assessment that the Defence should continue the current development, which involves increased use of civilians for supply tasks in international operations, taking into consideration the nature of the concrete task.

#### *Pre-deployment training*

- The Defence has continuously, and on the basis of experience gained from previous missions, adjusted the training of personnel for international operations.
- The Defence's evaluations of the army's response-force training programme emphasize that the training is very compressed. The evaluations underline that it is difficult to implement the training programme within the current time frame under conditions characterized by shortage of equipment and inadequate administrative support provided to the companies.
- In some phases of the training programme, there is shortage of equipment. This means that the soldiers do not get an opportunity to train with all the critical equipment before they are on the location of the mission. The Defence Agreement 2010-2014 is therefore allocating DKK 600 million for procurement of training equipment.
- The training programmes can be better planned, and the administrative burden on especially key personnel has been very heavy during the training programme. The Defence should therefore consider how the administrative burden on key personnel can be eased. The Defence has stated that Defence Command Denmark in mid-2009 implemented initiatives that have ensured that equipment has been prescribed and personnel selected approx. 12 months before deployment. These initiatives could provide a good platform for the future planning.

**In the period 2006-2008, Denmark has used more resources for the civil-military cooperation and the Comprehensive Approach in Helmand. The number of civilian advisers employed by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs has also risen in that period. The Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have worked out a strategy for the military and civil effort in Afghanistan and the Helmand province and set targets for the performance.**

- The number of civil-military cooperation projects and Comprehensive Approach projects has increased in the period 2006-2008 in Helmand, and Denmark is using more resources for the civil-military cooperation and the Comprehensive Approach.

- The Defence has only to a very limited extent accounted for the Comprehensive Approach projects in the period 2006-2009. The Ministry of Defence, the Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have in mid-2009 agreed that the accounts must be submitted on time in the future.
- The Ministry of Foreign Affairs has attached civilian advisers to the Danish battalion to advance the cooperation between the military and civilian effort. A sufficient number of civilian advisers should be employed to ensure the continuity of the civilian effort, and for instance allow for the advisers' leave of absence.
- Rigsrevisionen finds it positive that the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs have prepared annual plans and set targets for the military and civil effort in Helmand.
- Rigsrevisionen has not assessed the effect of the civil-military cooperation and the Comprehensive Approach. Rigsrevisionen considers it important that the Ministry of Defence and the Ministry of Foreign Affairs continue to assess and adjust the effort in the area.